



REGIONAL CONSULTATION ON THE POST-2015 DEVELOPMENT AGENDA

Inclusive and Sustainable Development: Perspectives from Europe and Central Asia on the Post-2015 Development Agenda

Istanbul, Turkey, 7–8 November 2013:

<u>Summary</u>

Introduction

1. The Regional Consultation on the Post-2015 Development Agenda was organized as a contribution from Europe and Central Asia to the ongoing global process of shaping the post-2015 development agenda. This region with high, middle and low-income countries encapsulates many of the global challenges in building inclusive, sustainable and prosperous societies and is therefore an important voice in the process to develop a development framework which is universal in scope and applicable to all countries. The meeting adds to the consultative processes that have been carried out at the global and national levels as well as in other regions.

2. The present document is a summary report of discussions among panellists and participants at the Regional Consultation on the Post-2015 Development Agenda for Europe and Central Asia which took place in Istanbul, from 7–8 November 2013. In addition to this summary of substantive discussions, the programme of the Regional Consultation with all speakers as well as presentations and statements are available on the <u>meeting website</u>¹, including those made by high-level representatives during the opening and closing segments and the key messages that were presented at the end of the meeting. A <u>background</u> advocacy report from the regional UN system², developed prior to the meeting, is also available online. This advocacy report was written as a collaborative effort by the United Nations system in Europe and Central Asia to provide policy-makers and negotiators of the future development agenda with a concise overview of the key points for each of the critical issues facing the region and to provide a helpful platform for the discussions in Istanbul.

3. The Regional Consultation was hosted by the Government of Turkey and organized

¹ www.worldwewant2015.org/EuropeCentralAsia.

² Building more inclusive, sustainable and prosperous societies in Europe and Central Asia, A common United Nations vision for the post-2015 development agenda.

by the UN Development Programme and the UN Economic Commission for Europe on behalf of and together with United Nations entities³ active in the region, with broad multi-stakeholder involvement.

4. More than 350 participants attended the Regional Consultation, including representatives from 40 governments, civil society organizations, academia, the private sector, and international organizations. Through multi-stakeholder panels and interactive debates, the meeting stimulated discussions among the different groups of participants and across a range of thematic areas. It was recognized that the open design of the event contributed to the quality and breadth of the outcome.

5. While negotiations on the post-2015 agenda and Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) will ultimately be decided by an intergovernmental process, civil society played an important and active role in the meeting. The Regional Consultation was preceded by a full-day civil society consultation, the outcomes of which were reported back to the meeting during the kick-off session. This event resulted in twenty priority areas⁴. (see Annex 1: *Recommendations by representatives from Major Groups & other Stakeholders, Regional CSO Consultation.*) Civil society representatives provided specific inputs to the panel discussions. In particular, women's and youth groups, among others, were active in the process. People with disabilities and representatives of the Major Groups were active in the discussions throughout the consultation.

6. The priorities and key messages formulated at the Regional Consultation will feed into the global negotiation process and will be promoted through various channels, including the Open Working Group on Sustainable Development Goals. Participants are invited to stay engaged in this process, which will eventually culminate in the adoption of a new development framework by September 2015.

Voices on the Post-2015 Agenda: Equality, Accountability and Sustainability

7. This introductory panel looked at the unique participatory nature of the process thus far to develop a new global development framework. Globally, over 1 million people have engaged in UN Development Group-led consultations, including over 250,000 citizens in this region. National consultations have taken place in Western European countries as well as in

³ Within the framework of the UN Development Group (UNDG) for Europe and Central Asia and the Regional Coordination Mechanism, the following UN entities were involved : United Nations Economic Commission for Europe (UNECE), United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF), World Health Organization (WHO), United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP), United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA), United Nations Industrial Development Organization (UNIDO), International Labour Organization (ILO) and International Organization for Migration (IOM).

⁴ Overarching Principles of the Post 2015 Framework, Regional Concerns, Measuring Inequalities, Good Governance, Accountability, The Power of Monitoring, Public Participation, Equality, Gender Equality, Social Protection, Healthy Lives, Sexual and Reproductive Health and Rights, Environmental Health, Population Dynamics, Migrant's Rights, The Rights of Refugees, Internally Displaces Persons and Asylum Seekers, Employment and Decent Work, Education, Comprehensive sexuality education, Environmental Sustainability within Planetary Boundaries & Environmental Governance, Climate Change and Food, Water and Chemical Safety

low-income countries of Central Asia. Consultations initiated by the European Union have informed its official position on the post-2015 development agenda. A youth consultation organized by UNICEF prior to the Regional Consultation brought together young people active throughout the region.

8. The process to arrive at a new agenda has been unprecedented in its reach, involving governments, civil society organizations, the private sector, trade unions, academia, farmers, young men and women and citizens at large from across the entire region. The consultative process also reached out to groups who are often excluded, such as people with disabilities, ethnic minorities, migrants, displaced people, and isolated communities.

Millennium Development Goals (MDGs): Unfinished business in the region

9. In Europe and Central Asia, while relatively higher per-capita income levels have contributed to largely eradicating extreme poverty, persistent exclusion and material deprivation have remained a reality for far too many people.

10. The MDG agenda is unfinished business in the region. It is crucial to accelerate efforts within the next two years in order to achieve the MDGs in the areas where progress is lagging behind. The fundamental areas covered by the MDGs, in particular education, health, job creation, gender equality and environmental sustainability, remain critically important, even in relatively wealthier countries. The goals of the MDGs must be met and these fundamental rights should be taken up in the post-2015 agenda with an enlarged approach and deeper level of ambition to go beyond the minimum towards transformative development.

Universality and equality as key pillars in the new agenda in Europe and Central Asia

11. Despite the wide scope, similar messages have emerged from these consultations: they call for a single, integrated, comprehensive and coherent agenda, universal in nature, with a consistent set of goals, which aim at eradicating poverty, promoting social inclusion and integrating sustainability into development. These goals must be relevant for developed as well as developing countries. They should lead to a structural transformation towards inclusive and sustainable growth, respecting key principles of good governance, human rights and equality.

12. Reducing inequalities in their many forms and tackling their root causes is particularly relevant for Europe and Central Asia, with calls for more equality between men and women, between rural and urban areas (or in many cases between capital cities and the rest of the country), among different ethnic or religious groups, and between rich and poor people.

13. The full integration into the society of people with disabilities requires a sensitization of public opinion as well as measures to be taken by national and local authorities, particularly in terms of access to public transportation and to regular channels of employment and education.

Implementation of the new agenda: Accountability and Participation

14. Building broad-based and strong partnerships is increasingly crucial to ensure successful implementation of the new development agenda. The voices of people engaged in defining the new agenda make the case for how sustainable development cannot be realized in silos; it requires solutions and engagement by a wide coalition of actors.

15. Young people asked to be included in policy design, monitoring and implementation of the new agenda (for example, but not limited to, the area of education). Young people are ready to participate, take action and responsibility and can provide good ideas and solutions. Therefore, they are not only the future generations but also our partners of today. The youth statements presented at the Regional Consultation⁵ convey the vision of young people for a future without poverty and with more action to bring about social justice.

16. Accountability for the post-2015 development agenda requires a renewed global partnership, involving a wide range of actors, going beyond the traditional donor-recipient relationship and covering all aspects of sustainable development. Within this enlarged approach to partnerships, the agreements of the Monterrey Conference on Financing for Development are still relevant and commitments on ODA should be delivered upon.

17. There was consensus among panellists that more robust accountability mechanisms need to be put in place. National authorities will play a key role in delivering the agenda. The private sector and civil society will also need to be involved in the implementation of the post-2015 agenda, and the scientific community has a part to play, since they are able to provide evidence-based and technical solutions. Comprehensive accountability also extends beyond domestic policy and beyond borders and should involve international mechanisms.

18. Key messages for the post-2015 agenda, as they emerged from this session, can be outlined as follows:

- It is crucial to strengthen efforts to deliver on MDGs, but also to increase the ambition for the new framework, particularly when it comes to addressing inequalities, good governance and environmental sustainability.
- The further deliberations on the post-2015 agenda need to continue in the open

⁵ Formulated by the Major Group of Children and Youth.

and participatory nature that has characterized the process thus far.

- The future goals must be relevant for developed as well as developing countries, and lead to a structural transformation towards inclusive and sustainable growth.
- Young people should be fully involved in shaping the new agenda. They are ready to participate, provide ideas and solutions, and take action and responsibility.
- Specific groups such as the elderly and persons with disabilities, require more proactive attention and measures.

Health and Social Protection

19. This panel was the first thematic panel of the conference. It focused on an exploration of the regional landscape with regard to health and social protection and looked at ways of enhancing quality health for all and social protection and inclusion, including through social protection floors, in the post-2015 context.

Persisting inequalities in health and social protection: a major obstacle to inclusive societies in the region

20. Despite heartening progress in expanding the quality of and access to health care and social protection in many countries, persisting inequalities, both between and within countries, continue to hinder progress towards inclusive societies. In addition, new demographic, environmental and health challenges, as well as the financial situation of many countries in the region, put pressure on the health and social protection systems.

21. Important gaps persist in regional coverage by health and social protection systems. A Review of social determinants and the health divide in the WHO European Region highlights considerable inequalities and points to a 17-year gap in life expectancy for men and a 12-year gap in life expectancy for women between the countries with the highest and lowest life expectancy in the region. Most of the countries in the lowest quintile are located in the eastern parts of the region.

22. Health inequalities are unnecessary, avoidable and unjust, and can be tackled by action on the social, economic and environmental determinants, i.e. the conditions in which people are born, grow, live, work and age. But the health sector cannot do this on its own. Many other sectors, such as education, transport, housing, planning, finance, trade, and business, need to be involved. Panellists agreed that action needs to come from the whole of government and the whole of society.

23. Similar concerns over inequalities were expressed in terms of old-age pension coverage. Globally, only 55 per cent of those above the statutory retirement age are actually receiving old-age pension benefits. While these shares are above 90 per cent for Western, Central, and Eastern Europe, demographic and fiscal trends raise questions about

sustainability and adequacy of benefits. In the region's low- and lower-middle income countries with large informal sectors, millions of migrant workers, and shallow financial systems, the longer-term financial sustainability of pension systems is a major concern. Similar challenges exist for unemployment benefit and poverty eradication schemes. Moreover, the fiscal space available for addressing these gaps in much of the region is shrinking.

Taking up the unfinished business of health-related MDGs and addressing the new health challenges

24. While the MDGs provided a very useful global framework for mobilizing action and monitoring progress, one of the lessons learnt relates to the fragmentary effect of goals aiming at disease-prevention. There is a need to have a more integrated focus in the post-2015 agenda compared to the current MDG approach. For example, while emphasis on reducing maternal mortality (MDG 5), has supported significant improvements in maternal health during the past decade, these have not been accompanied by commensurate improvements in access to sexual and reproductive health services.

25. Looking ahead towards the post-2015 development agenda, both the "unfinished" business of the MDGs and emerging health challenges due to demographic and economic changes need to be addressed. The unfinished business, illustrated by gaps and inequalities in achieving the health MDGs 4, 5, and 6 (such as reducing mortality and improving child and maternal health, and combating TB and HIV/AIDS) should be included in the new agenda. It was pointed out by some speakers that the post-2015 agenda should also address new health threats, such as non-communicable diseases and mental health, as well as addressing sexual and reproductive health and rights. There should be a holistic and inclusive approach to the new health goals, based on the concept of well-being and not merely the absence of death and disease, and aimed at maximizing healthy life expectancy, the Universal Health Coverage being a key instrument in this respect. This was also concluded by the <u>UN</u> <u>Development Group global thematic consultation on Health</u>, which was co-led by Sweden and Botswana.

Health as a critical component of sustainable development

26. Health is a critical component of and contributor to sustainable development, both as a goal and a cross cutting issue. In this respect, "every sector is a health sector". Better health reduces costs and increases productivity, which can be a significant factor for poverty reduction and material welfare.

27. Panellists referred to WHO's European policy for health and well-being, <u>Health 2020</u>, as an important regional policy framework for health and well-being, and considered it

crucial for setting the ground and formulating a new vision for health for the post-2015 agenda.

Social protection floors as a framework for shaping comprehensive social security systems

28. Social protection floors are important both as frameworks for ensuring integrated, whole-of-government and life-long approaches to health and social protection, and as a way of ensuring that social rights, including the right to quality health outcomes, are respected. National social protection floors are an effective tool to address both income and health insecurities, and thus present a universal policy instrument to tackle the challenges of this as well as other regions.

29. Social protection floors can guarantee access to health and basic income for all, and also ensure minimum access to nutritious food, water and energy for the most disadvantageous groups of population. Panellists stressed that they constitute a fundamental element of comprehensive social security systems, promoted in particular through the <u>International Labour Conference Recommendation (No. 202) on Social Protection Floors</u>. New social protection strategies have also been recently articulated by the European Union, the World Bank, ILO, UNICEF, and the World Food Programme. It is also apparent in the decision to prioritize social protection under the Russian Federation's current presidency of the Group of 20 (G-20) as well as Turkey's and Australia's ambitions to follow-up on this priority during their upcoming G-20 presidencies.

Improving social and health outcomes in practice

30. Positive experiences exist in the region on how to improve social and health outcomes. For example, Turkey achieved significant progress in poverty reduction and insurance and pension coverage. On the other hand, inequalities in health outcomes remain a challenge, with gender and locational factors being important factors.

Gender equality and women's rights as key dimensions of health and social protection

31. The speaker from the Women's Major Group, with support from others, emphasized that human rights and gender aspects of health and social protection are essential, including sexual and reproductive health and rights. Recent research shows that women who are victims of physical or sexual violence are much more likely to report being in 'poor' or 'very poor' health. Forced and early marriages seem to contribute significantly to reproductive health problems, higher incidence of sexually transmitted diseases, higher maternal and child morbidity and mortality rates, among other health problems.

A new global consensus on health and social protection

32. Considering that health and income security are inextricably linked, a new global consensus on health and social protection is emerging. This consensus emphasizes the avoidance of competition for resources between income security and health security objectives, and the adoption of whole-of-government, integrated approaches to health and social protection. Such holistic approaches lead to nationally defined social protection floors and universal health coverage which provide access to high quality health services (including promotion, prevention, treatment, and rehabilitation), ensure financial protection to prevent ill health from pushing people into poverty and guarantee basic income security for those unable to earn a living (e.g., the elderly, children, people with disabilities).

33. This session brought forward the following key messages for the new agenda:

- Work on the unfinished MDG agenda should continue, in addition to tackling new health challenges, such as Non-communicable Diseases and mental health.
- Health outcomes and income security are inextricably linked; hence the call for establishing national social protection floors which would guarantee access to health and basic income for all, and also ensure minimum access to nutritious food, water and energy for the most disadvantaged groups of population.
- The new agenda should advocate for a whole-of-government, whole-of-society and a life-course approach which is crucial for addressing the social, economic and environmental determinants of health and for the well-being of societies at large.
- New demographic and environmental challenges, as well as fiscal tensions, put pressure on the health and social protection systems and should be addressed by the new agenda.
- Universal health coverage and access and social protection coverage through establishing and maintaining national social protection floors are key to achieving health goals and poverty eradication targets.
- Sexual and reproductive health and rights, and comprehensive sexuality education should be considered for integration in the future development framework.

Education and Decent Jobs

34. Panel Two focused on two themes: (i) Equal opportunities in access to quality education, and (ii) Equal opportunities in access to labour markets. The outcome of the interactive exchange of views and experiences among representatives from government, the private sector, trade union, academia, and young people is summarized below.

Good school enrollment rate in the region but insufficient learning outcomes

35. While enrolment rates in primary school in the region are high – over 95 per cent in

most countries, national averages hide huge disparities, with children from ethnic minorities (especially Roma) and children with disabilities being largely excluded from mainstream school and quality education. Although the level of (formal) education is on average high in the region, there are problems with its quality and relevance for the labour market.

36. The panelists discussed emerging good practices and policy efforts in the region to provide education with practical relevance for labour markets in Turkey and Albania including upper secondary education being made compulsory; poor families receiving benefits and incentives to send their children to school; and technical schools being connected with industry, thereby facilitating the transition from school to work.

37. A compounding problem is poor learning outcomes. The OECD's Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) shows very low learning achievements in Europe and Central Asia with, on average, about half of 15 years-old students not reaching basic proficiency levels in reading, mathematics and science. Poor learning outcomes have direct implications for labour and employment outcomes. In addition, there is a significant mismatch between available skills and qualifications and the skills requirements of the labour market, with four million vacant jobs in Europe. Entrepreneurial skills are insufficiently taught in the classroom.

38. One factor is how parents' hopes for the future of their children are too often disconnected from the reality of the labour market. Too many young people pursue general education and fail to secure decent jobs, rather than going to technical or vocational education for which there is demand on the labour market. Part of the problem here is that statistical information on education outcomes and the labour market situation is inaccurate or missing, making it difficult to guide policy-making.

39. Poor learning outcomes and mismatch of skills, compounded by the slowdown of economic growth and slow job creation, are the major factors leading to a high level of youth unemployment in the region, reaching even 50 per cent and more in some countries. Also, child labour remains an issue in a number of countries in the region.

Reducing inequalities in education

40. Looking ahead, there is a need to reduce inequalities, ensure the benefits of growth are enjoyed more equitably by all sectors of society, and re-direct resources to quality education. Panelists called for education systems that are more inclusive for all children, particularly children with disabilities, children from ethnic minorities, and children from disadvantaged families. There are two priority areas for action in this respect:

• Building up education capacity in all locations where vulnerable groups are living,

especially at the decentralized level in rural schools and rural communities;

• Preventing early school leaving by strengthening compensation programmes for those at risk of dropping out.

41. Making upper-secondary education available and accessible for all children is also essential, as GDP levels have been linked globally to the number of school years. Following school age, policies and measures for life-long learning should be promoted, directed both to youth and adults, especially those with low or obsolete education in order to help them gain and keep good employment.

Improving the quality of education

42. The quality of education is also an important priority. To improve the quality of teaching, it is important to enhance the motivation of teachers and to invest in their education and professional development. This could be achieved, in particular, by giving them access to further capacity-building on new technologies and to information on business sector needs. This approach should be accompanied by appropriate investment in up-to-date equipment of schools and training institutions.

Investing in early childhood development and education

43. The importance of investing in early childhood development and early childhood education was strongly emphasized as it yields developmental, social and demographic dividends as well as economic returns. These returns can exceed 4 to 17 times the investment, with dividends particularly high when benefits accrue to socio-economically disadvantaged children. Returns have been observed in the short term, with fewer children out of school and better learning outcomes, as well as later in life through higher wages and career prospects, higher taxes and public revenues, lower health care costs, etc. Therefore, investing in the early years, and enhancing parents' skills for early stimulation and early learning, is an opportunity that cannot be missed.

Reducing mismatch between education and skills demands on the labor market

44. Close links should be established between the government, business, trade unions, youth and civil society for jointly shaping and implementing education and training policies that would deliver knowledge relevant for the labour market. These policies need to be based on accurate and comprehensive information on the education process and its outcomes as well as on the labour market situation. Young people should be provided with opportunities to participate in, and contribute to the development of education policies.

Revisiting economic and labour market policies for fostering job creation and decent work

45. Good education is crucial but not sufficient for ensuring good employment. There is a need for active employment and labour market policies that would improve access of people, in particular disadvantaged groups, to the labour market and support their employment in jobs that provide at least living wages, are socially protected and performed in healthy working conditions, respect workers' rights and give them a voice in social dialogue and collective bargaining.

46. These policies would have an impact on income distribution by reducing the number of precarious jobs and promoting decent work. They should be supported by employment-oriented economic policies that lead to the creation of quality jobs through greening the economy and stimulating entrepreneurship, investment and business development. The Decent Work Agenda provides the right framework for such policies. It is of utmost importance to stimulate the creation of sufficient numbers of quality jobs, in particular for youth in new sectors such as green economy and care services.

47. It is also critically important for all countries to guarantee the rights of people at work through greater ratification of international labour conventions, and for young people entering on the job market to be aware of their rights.

48. At the international level, globalization makes the need for integrating labour market and skill building policies across countries and international cooperation more relevant than ever.

49. The following key messages for the new development agenda with regard to education and decent employment can be outlined:

- Any goal on education should call for reducing inequalities in access to school and re-directing public resources to quality education, ensuring good learning outcomes for all.
- Investing in early childhood development and early childhood education should be a priority in education since it yields developmental, social and demographic dividends as well as economic returns.
- Mismatch between skills/qualification and the job market is a major concern. This needs to be addressed through improvement of curricula, lifelong learning and knowledge development. Accurate and timely information on the education process and labour markets and engaging all relevant stakeholders can also create effective solutions to this mismatch.
- Revisiting economic, social and labour market policies for fostering job creation and decent work, and for greening the economy should be at the core of a potential goal on employment.

Population Dynamics and Migration

50. Panel Three looked at how population dynamics and migration should be addressed in the post-2015 development agenda in a region which is the most advanced in terms of demographic trends, such as ageing, and where these are often considered as challenges rather than as opportunities.

51. Most countries in the region are faced with low (below replacement) fertility rates, rapidly increasing shares of elderly population, and many countries experience large volumes of migration. These issues are not currently addressed in any of the MDG goals and population dynamics as such would not qualify as a stand-alone post-2015 goal, with the possible exception of migration. However, population issues have profound impact on sustainable development and must therefore be considered as a critical cross-cutting issue in the post-2015 development agenda.

52. Population dynamics and migration continue to be regarded as controversial issues in many countries of the region, often triggering narrow-focused, reactive, policy responses. A more constructive, holistic approach is required, which recognizes existing opportunities and integrates human rights.

Changing the perception of ageing

53. The keynote speaker proposed that a paradigm shift is needed to redefine the concept of ageing and give greater credence to the growing belief that below-replacement fertility does not necessarily contribute to economic hardship. Populations nowadays live longer and can remain healthy and productive for many more years than previously. It would therefore be appropriate to measure dependency, i.e. the ratio of older people to people at working age, in terms of "remaining years of life expectancy" rather than by using a fixed threshold of, for instance, 65 years for old age. This more flexible measure shows the ageing situation in Western European countries to be much less dramatic than is often believed. Consequently, the paradigm shift also requires a rethinking of pension systems. It must also be noted, however, that this approach does not improve the statistics for Eastern Europe, as life expectancy values in most Eastern European countries are considerably lower.

54. There are firmly entrenched beliefs about the negative effects of ageing in the region and by and large those negative effects have been exaggerated and can be largely mitigated by two policies: upgrading skill levels and increasing labor force participation. Better education is linked to improved health and reduced disabilities, as well as to enhanced employment and productivity.

Calls for a positive approach to human mobility, ageing and migration

55. Human mobility is one of the defining features of today's world, with one in seven persons worldwide being a migrant. The remittances from these migrants amount to an estimated 400 billion USD annually, and thus vastly outnumber the amounts spent on Official Development Assistance (ODA). It was also noted that the nature of migration flows has changed, and is no longer limited to south/north flows, with south/south migration having become just as important. In Eastern Europe and Central Asia, Tajikistan, Kyrgyzstan and Moldova are the largest receivers of migrants' remittances. For these countries, as well as for Armenia, Georgia, and Kosovo (under Security Council resolution 1244), ODA receipts are dwarfed by remittance inflows.

56. Demographic and labour market trends in the region point to the fact that migration is both inevitable and necessary. Migration has emerged as a significant factor for the achievement of the economic, social and environmental pillars of sustainable development. While the link between underdevelopment and forced and unsafe forms of migration should be taken into account, migration is a megatrend which can act as an enabler for human development. For that reason, migration should be included in the post-2015 development agenda, in particular as one of the key components of a strengthened Global partnership, along with other issues such as trade and transfer of technologies. In doing so, special attention should be paid to the human rights of migrants, and migrants in crisis situations.

57. There are a number of concrete actions the international community could take to maximize the potential development gains of migration, such as cutting the costs and risks of migration, and bringing about a fundamental shift in the perception of migrants as part of an effort to ensure the enjoyment and fulfillment of migrants' rights. Along the same lines, combating women and child trafficking should be a key issue addressed in the future development agenda.

Mainstreaming migration into national development strategies

58. It is also critical to integrate migration into national development strategies, especially for countries with large proportions of the economically active population living abroad. This situation presents numerous challenges, for instance with regards to family formation and child care.

59. In the case of one particular country, Moldova, the government developed migrant profiles which aim to help understand the impact of migration and formulate appropriate policies. This has resulted in two major national strategies: 1) a strategy on demographic security, which aims to reform the system of social protection to account for the impact of migration; and 2) a strategy on migration and asylum, which aims at reducing unregulated

migration, addresses return migration, and protects rights of migrants, for instance with regards to paying double tax.

The impact of gender equality on human development

60. Gender equality is also a key dimension to achieve well-being and prosperity. In the particular example of Denmark, the Danish labour market comprises a very high proportion of women, and parents are provided a total of 52 weeks of parental leave and job security ensured. A flexible labor market combined with a well-developed day-care system further facilitates raising children. Moreover, the educational attainment of Danish women is higher than that of men, although the actual occupational positions of women tend to be lower than those of men.

The human rights dimension of population dynamics and migration

61. In the view of youth represented at the Consultation, sustainable development will not be possible 1) without protection of rights for young people; 2) when governments deny access to sexual and reproductive health and rights; and 3) when human rights are being violated in the name of religion or traditional values. Human rights must be a key component of sustainable policies and programmes, and that these must include the protection of vulnerable groups, such as sex workers, migrants and refugees.

62. The panel concluded with the following key messages for the post-2015 development agenda:

- Any sustainable development strategy needs to take population dynamics into consideration.
- Migration needs to be incorporated into the post-2015 development agenda with targets for relevant specific development goals; in particular, it should be a key element in a new Global Partnership for Development. This should be complemented by indicators which monitor the upholding of the rights of migrants.
- Any policy aimed at addressing the impacts of population dynamics and migration must respect human rights, including sexual and reproductive rights.
- Gender equality can be a key to addressing demographic challenges, and is a prerequisite for sustainable development.

Natural Resources, Sustainable Production and Consumption, and Green Cities

63. Panel Four examined how the post-2015 agenda could best integrate the dimension

of environmental sustainability. Environmental sustainability is not only an end in itself: unsustainable use of natural resources exacerbates poverty, inequality and future prospects for human development. Also, inequality of access to natural resources threatens prospects for building more inclusive and sustainable societies, for instance by adversely affecting food security and agricultural development. Formulating environmental goals for the future agenda therefore needs to involve a process of balancing human needs and planetary boundaries. Against this backdrop, the panel focused on three key aspects: (i) sustainable use and management of natural resources and ecosystems; (ii) sustainable consumption and production; and (iv) sustainable cities.

Advocating for wise use and sustainable management of natural resources in all dimensions of human activities

64. The values and benefits provided by our natural capital and ecosystems are poorly understood and often underestimated. They provide and support an array of benefits ranging from ecological, economic, social to cultural. They regulate essential processes such as purification of air and water, pollination of crops, nutrient cycling and protecting soils from erosion; they remain essential to our prosperity generating economic goods and services, supporting livelihoods and other aspects of our welfare; and they also play an important role in maintaining cultural traditions.

65. Considering the benefits of these services, the wise use and management of natural resources in different economic sectors (agriculture, forestry, energy, water, etc.) should be given the highest importance when pursuing economic development. This implies respect for nature, including the welfare of animals.

66. Therefore assessing and taking into account the economic, social and cultural value of these natural capitals and ecosystems and improving valuation approaches should play a key role in efforts to achieve sustainable development. These values should be integrated into strategies for development and poverty reduction as well as policy-making and planning processes. The panel discussed efforts to conduct integrated planning and to assign long-term value to biodiversity in Georgia.

67. Looking ahead towards the post-2015 development agenda, it is important to integrate an approach that can help to recognize the values of natural capital and ecosystems and to develop goals and targets that give priority to the sustainable use and management of natural resources to achieve sustainable development. In a broader context, reversing biodiversity loss, reducing greenhouse gas emissions and de-intensifying agriculture will be key objectives. Beyond what is agreed in the post-2015 and Sustainable Development Goal agenda, panellists discussed the continued need to implement existing environmental goals and commitments within multilateral environmental agreements.

Transforming consumption and production patterns for sustainable lifestyles

68. Consumption and production are key engines of every economy. However, unsustainable patterns of consumption and production have become major causes for the continued deterioration of the global environment and the depletion of scarce resources. Therefore, changing consumption and productions patterns and promoting sustainable lifestyles in a society in an integrated and systematic manner will be crucial to the achievement of sustainable development. Sustainable consumption and production is about delivering more (goods and services) with less (resource use and pollution). In some contexts it is also about consuming less.

69. Sustainable consumption and production is closely linked with the green economy, material and energy efficiency and cities. Dealing with unsustainable patterns of consumption and production is at the core of finding sustainable solutions for many of the challenges we are facing. Therefore, the discussion on sustainable consumption and production should be at the center of the post-2015 development agenda discussion and should also be considered as a stand-alone SDG.

70. The promotion of sustainable consumption and production has been intensified since Rio 1992 and again reinforced at Rio+20 with the adoption of the 10 Year Framework of Programmes on Sustainable Consumption and Production. As the panelist from Romania pointed out, the objective of the framework is to accelerate the shift towards sustainable consumption and production patterns in both developed and developing countries by supporting regional and national policies and initiatives.

Engaging in sustainable production and energy patterns

71. Despite significant improvements, production patterns in many countries are still highly energy- and resource-intensive, contributing to the continued deterioration of the environment through emissions of waste, toxic materials, pollutants, and depletion of scarce resources. In order to reduce the ecological footprint of both producing and exporting countries, panellists concluded that it is necessary to accelerate the shift from 'brown' to 'green' economies, building on progress that has been made. Bold commitment is required, as well as policy formulation, long-term vision, and leadership to apply and replicate the good practices that exist.

72. Energy is fundamental for meeting societies' needs and achieving long-term sustainable development. The ability to invest in and secure competitive and sustainable energy options will open up opportunities for creating economic growth, new jobs, and more healthy societies. A key policy tool stressed by the panel is phasing out fossil fuel subsidies in order to ensure that energy prices reflect real costs. It is necessary to lower the

energy intensity of sectors such as production, transport and housing, and increase energy and resource efficiency, which is low in parts of the region.

73. There is also considerable potential to tap into the vast reserves of renewable and clean energy resources. There are many examples in the region how solar, wind, water and geothermal energy are effectively used to light homes and run businesses. While small scale efforts are nascent, it is necessary to redouble efforts to bring this mix into the mainstream of energy resources and significantly reduce negative environmental and health impacts.

74. In the broader context of sustainable production, it is also necessary to de-intensify agriculture and to promote sustainable agricultural practices. In addition, there is a need to eliminate harmful substances, in particular carcinogenic substances and all other chemicals that may have adverse health impacts.

75. Regarding sustainable consumption and production altogether, it is crucial to address the "spend more, consume more" behavior, and to invest in education and training for new skills and a knowledge-based economy, and innovation. All of the above requires the involvement of governments, private sector/businesses, communities and households. However, governments have the primary responsibility to ensure policies, priorities, plans and decisions are put into action. They have a key role through setting policy frameworks, investments, procurement practices and assessing legislative proposals for sustainability and effectively using Strategic Environmental Assessment and Environmental Impact Assessment to make informed decisions.

Creating sustainable, resilient and green cities

76. In an increasingly urbanized world, cities are a significant part and driver of global environmental change. While cities in Europe have an average population density compared to other regions, urban challenges also exist in this region. To a large extent, patterns of energy use, transport, social cohesion and economic development are shaped in urban areas. Therefore, panellists called attention to the need for policy choices that help transform our cities into sustainable cities full of opportunities and services for all. Urban planning and investment in public infrastructure is crucial for the sustainable development of cities. In addition, democratic urban governance, citizen participation and expertise-based decision-making will be essential to move towards smart, resilient, liveable and green cities. Modern technology also provides opportunities to progress towards 'smart cities' by using and providing access to data and information, for instance to inform citizens of temporary service cut-offs.

77. In the post-2015 agenda, goals on sustainable urbanization and global environmental change in an urban context will be useful to continue the unfinished urban agenda of the MDGs. Targets could involve creating livable human settlements and preserving natural

landscapes and ecosystems. In order to implement these goals, monitoring of progress and improving the quality and availability of urban data will be important.

78. Key messages on environmental sustainability for the post-2015 agenda emerged as follows:

- Sustainable management and use of natural resources and ecosystems have not been sufficiently taken into consideration in the MDGs and should become central to the SDGs.
- The new agenda should take into account existing environmental goals and call for the effective implementation of the various multilateral environmental agreements, both at the global and regional levels.
- A goal on sustainable consumption and production patterns should be considered to balance human needs and planetary boundaries.
- At the national level, vertical integration of government is needed with more roles for local decisions and implementation.
- Cities are a driver of global environmental change. There is a need for policy choices to transform cities into sustainable, resilient and green cities, using urban planning, technology, and citizen participation.

Making the New Agenda Work: Rule of Law, Good Governance and Participation

79. Panel Five explored participation, human rights and action at the local level as essential ingredients in making the new sustainable development agenda work.

80. While the Millennium Development Goals have wielded impressive mobilizing power in important areas including the fight against poverty, health and education, as indicators of overall development progress, many people think that the MDGS failed to capture important issues recognized in the Millennium Declaration, such as effective and responsive state institutions, inclusive societies and political systems and the advancement of human rights. These fundamental pillars of sustainable development are gaining renewed currency in the global debate about the next development agenda.

Rule of law, governance and human rights: a high priority for the people of the region

81. People across Europe and Central Asia see rule of law, good governance and human rights as both enablers of sustainable development and core elements of well-being. This emerged from the consultations on the post-2015 agenda which revealed that honest and responsible governments is a high priority in the region (see, for example, the results of the <u>MY World Survey</u>).

82. For the post-2015 development agenda, the principles of human rights and rule of

law can no longer be additional or aspirational: they need to be at the heart of the agenda. Similarly, peace and good governance are not optional extras: they need to be an integral part of the new agenda. Many participants suggest that this integration should exceed the level of principles, and be considered in terms of targets on which progress can be assessed.

83. A "transparency revolution" is needed. It is necessary that people are involved in decisions that affect them and have ample opportunity to see where their money is being spent. For this purpose, greater cooperation in decision-making – e.g. through consultation with NGOs before any legal decision for example - is instrumental. Relevant good practices exist in the region, for instance in Latvia, where open government practices are becoming the norm rather than the exception.

84. People's engagement is not only a normative agenda, it can also create new and better solutions as people themselves are "public policy experts". This is why there is a need to be more accepting of dissent, with a suitable legal environment securing the right to protest, and to allow civil society organizations to engage in policy processes. The panel explored how dialogue and open engagement with citizens, for example in Tul'chyn municipality, can lead not only to more popular but often more efficient decisions. Sustainable development policies have to be inclusive both in their formulation and their implementation.

People's participation in practice

85. The region has a good body of experience with legal frameworks, participatory processes as well as internet platforms for engagement. Proven transparency practices, participatory planning and accountability mechanisms have been put in place at the local and national levels in a significant number of countries. Regional agreements, such as the UNECE Aarhus Convention on public participation in environmental matters, support these good practices.

86. Some countries have made consultation with non-state actors a requirement, and others have realized that even in poor communities, co-financing, social innovation and co-production can work in practice. Social innovation which combines business models for broader social gains is considered key for creating a better balance between economic, social and environmental interests.

87. Compared to 2000 when the Millennium Development Goals were established, more citizen engagement, including at a decentralized level, has been made possible through the establishment of participation platforms and the use of new technologies. The UNDG consultation processes illustrate the potential power this form of people's engagement and should be here to stay. Panellists cited that an example of progress in people's engagement for sustainable development is the increasing number of cases taken to court in order to

receive compensation for environmental, health and social damage.

88. Global agendas are useful as a catalyst and a way to compare progress and share experiences across countries, but real action happens at the local level. Citizen engagement in local decision-making through dialogue with local authorities is therefore an important way forward. Similarly, support for local projects through cost-sharing whenever possible, prove to work well for gaining trust, mobilizing and developing capacities of local communities.

89. Based on high individual capacity levels and internet penetration, the region has the potential to further engage people not only as voters and consumers but as citizens. Active civil society involvement guarantees accountability and also builds social cohesion. In that sense, rule of law, participation, human rights and good governance could be considered as the fourth dimension of sustainable development.

No sustainable development without the full involvement of women and youth

90. Gender equality, women's empowerment and greater involvement of youth are essential for making large progress in all dimensions of sustainable development. This implies equal access to justice as well as the development and effective enforcement of legal frameworks.

The need for effective accountability mechanisms

91. The new thrust of the development agenda stresses the importance of open and accountable institutions. Youth representatives underlined that in order to hold governments properly to account, young people need to have access to comprehensive education which gives them the skills and knowledge required for their involvement in public policy debate and decision making (e.g. civic awareness and global citizenship). Tracking the use of money by governments and local authorities was highlighted as an important sphere for accountability since it is a most effective way to assess whether this money is not diverted and whether the public commitments taken are followed through in practice. The region is increasingly pursuing new approaches for citizen engagement, whereby citizens propose policies and develop solutions for local sustainable development issues.

- 92. This session highlighted the following key messages for the post-2015 agenda:
 - People across Europe and Central Asia see good governance as a high priority which should therefore be fully reflected in the new agenda, possibly in the form of a goal.

- The principles of human rights and rule of law can no longer be additional or aspirational: they need to be at the heart of the agenda with active measures for assessing progress.
- Involvement of civil society in policy-making needs deliberate investment and monitoring because citizen engagement can lead not only to more popular but also more just and efficient decisions.
- A "transparency revolution" is needed to keep people engaged in public policy processes.
- Particular attention should be paid to the full involvement of women and youth in development processes.

<u>The Power of Measurement: New Forms of Monitoring Progress in Sustainable</u> <u>Development</u>

93. Panel Six discussed the importance of effective measurement, monitoring and reporting in the development of the post-2015 agenda. The monitoring process for the MDGs transmitted important lessons on maintaining focus on internationally agreed development goals and targets, while keeping society informed of the achievements, problem areas and emerging issues.

94. It is widely acknowledged by politicians, researchers and the society at large that robust statistical information is essential for good policy making. High-quality data is needed to provide information on the status of progress under the new agenda, improve decision-making, hold policy-makers accountable and help monitor the efficacy of policies. But good data and measurement does not come automatically. It requires the necessary resources, both financial and human, the right methodologies and methods, and the appropriate technologies.

95. The Report of the High-level Panel of Eminent Persons on the Post-2015 Development agenda stresses the importance of good statistics and calls for a "data revolution." Better data and statistics will help governments track progress and make sure their decisions are evidence-based; they can also strengthen accountability. This is not just about governments. International organizations, civil society and the private sector should be involved. A true 'data revolution' will draw on existing and new sources of data to fully integrate statistics into decision-making, promote open access to, and use of, data and ensure increased support for statistical systems. The panel discussion formulated requirements in a number of areas to meet these challenges.

Drawing lessons from the shaping of MDG targets and indicators

96. It was noted that the statistical community was not adequately consulted in

developing the MDGs and in defining the respective targets and indicators, which led to measurement problems. Therefore, panellists stressed that statisticians should be involved in the process of formulating the post-2015 measurement framework from the outset. Numerical targets should balance ambition and realism and take into account what is possible to achieve. Targets should also reflect a clear consensus and understanding of the objectives among policy makers, civil society and the public. A limited number of well-defined, objectively measurable, and relevant indicators need to be developed to track progress under the new agenda. The indicators should be clear and easy to communicate.

97. To the extent possible, the indicators should be based on well-structured and goodquality official statistics. Investment in national statistical systems and countries' capacities, will need to be significantly stepped up also in light of the broader scope of the new development agenda. Statistics used should be sound, consistent and continuously available over time. Data gaps, discrepancies, reporting delays and deficiencies in data collection need to be addressed. In addition, data should be created and disseminated through the collaboration of various stakeholders, including national statistical offices, international organizations, civil society and the private sector. The role of each actor in this process should be well-defined, as was pointed out by the panelist from the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia.

Building upon existing measurement frameworks

98. While developing SDGs is a new challenge, it is important to build on existing experience in goal-setting, monitoring and implementation. The panel referred to already existing measurement frameworks, such as the recently developed <u>UNECE</u> recommendations on measuring sustainable development, which propose a measurement framework and potential sets of indicators, and the interim report of the <u>Asia-Europe</u> <u>Environment Forum on SDGs and Indicators for a Small Planet</u>, which proposes to develop sustainability dashboards to represent and follow-up on the future SDGs and their targets and indicators. The panel also emphasized that while the set of goals should be universally applicable, these goals should also be flexible enough to allow for each country to determine its own targets, consistent with its own development agenda.

Measuring Inclusive and Sustainable Development: the Palma measure of inequality

99. Going beyond the largely sectoral MDGs towards an integrated and cross-sectoral agenda of sustainable development will pose complex challenges to measuring and monitoring. A combination of qualitative and quantitative measures will be needed to provide a holistic assessment of the progress made. Previously neglected dimensions, such as inequality, environmental sustainability and governance are increasingly measurable through new measurement approaches.

100. A good example of a viable way to measure inequality is the 'Palma' measure, defined as the ratio of the income share of the top 10 per cent to that of the bottom 40 per cent. This measure better captures high inequality compared to measures traditionally used (i.e., the Gini coefficient). The Palma measure of income inequality sends clearer policy signals as it focuses on the 'tails', i.e. the extremes. The Palma measure is useful for policymakers who wish to analyze the effective gap in income inequality, an area that is receiving increasing attention in the post-2015 debate.

New data sources and citizen participation

101. The use of technology and citizen participation is expanding the data available for monitoring progress on development issues. Freely available open data and large, complex "big" data provide more timely proxies for emerging trends. Big data is proving useful in providing real-time information to policy-makers on issues such as economic vulnerability, and disaster preparedness and response. For example, up-to-date information on prices of essential commodities in developing countries is increasingly available via mobile phones and provided to policy makers to avoid time-lags of official reporting procedures. By using various data which is citizen generated, policy makers and development organizations get speedier insight into household finances and vulnerability. Likewise, citizens in many countries have options to report experiences of corruption using mobile phones, an anonymous way to generate data on this issue which is often hard to monitor.

102. Given the region's widespread use of mobile phones and social media, decentralized monitoring of public services by citizens is increasingly enhancing traditional data collection and dissemination. Through new technology, crowd sourcing and improved global connectivity, citizens are directly engaging with the monitoring process. The post-2015 agenda will need to better connect the big data and open data movements with the official statistics community and take advantage of this low cost source of data in order levels in order to improve timeliness of development data and increase citizen engagement in the delivery of sustainable development.

103. The following messages for the new agenda emerged from this session:

- Given the expectations to deliver timely and accurate monitoring data, the statistical community should be involved in the process of formulating the post-2015 agenda from the outset
- Investment in national statistical systems and countries' capacities cannot be seen as an optional element: it is a sine qua non for ensuring that statistics used for indicators are sound, accurate, consistent and timely available
- Cooperation between different data producers, governments, businesses and civil

society needs to be strengthened in order to ensure that data assists policy formulation and decision-making

- Open data and big data are proving useful as they provide policy-makers with realtime insight and proxies. Integrating new sources of data and ensuring transparency is an essential part of the data revolution.
- Measuring sustainable and inclusive development will require new measures, such as the 'Palma' measure of inequality and others, which send clear policy signals to decision-makers about the nature of inequality where it matters most.

Recommendations by representatives from Major Groups & other Stakeholders

Regional CSO Consultation "Perspectives from Europe and Central Asia on the Post-2015 / SDG Agenda"

Istanbul, Turkey 6 November 2013

Contents

Introduction and methodology

- 1) Overarching Principles of the Post 2015 Framework
- 2) Regional Concerns
- 3) Measuring Inequalities, Good Governance, Accountability
- 4) The Power of Monitoring
- 5) Public Participation
- 6) Equality
- 7) Gender Equality
- 8) Social Protection
- 9) Healthy Lives
- 10)Sexual and Reproductive Health and Rights
- 11) Environmental Health, Population Dynamics
- 12)Migrant's Rights
- 13)The Rights of Refugees
- 14)Internally Displaces Persons and Asylum Seekers
- 15) Employment and Decent Work
- 16)Education
- 17)Comprehensive sexuality education
- 18)Environmental Sustainability within Planetary Boundaries & Environmental Governance
- 19)Climate Change
- 20)Food, Water and Chemical Safety

Introduction and methodology

This is the report of the Civil Society consultation which preceded the official regional consultation, "Inclusive and Sustainable Development: Perspectives from Europe and Central Asia on the Post-2015 Development Agenda", that took place on the 7-8 November 2013. The CSO consultation was self-organised and included over 100 CSO participants from the region, see annex 1, participants list. Representatives from the Major Groups⁶ for Children and Youth, Farmers, Indigenous People, Local Authorities, Non-Governmental Organisations, Women, Trade Unions, as well as representatives from Beyond 2015 participated in the consultation. Further, a number of UN representatives and observers participated.

The participants divided themselves into the following thematic groups to develop key recommendations; 1. Overall Framework: Equality Accountability and Sustainability, 2. Education and Decent Jobs, 3. Health and Social Protection, 4. Population Dynamics and Migration, 5. Natural Resources, Sustainable Consumption & Production, Green Cities, 6. Making the New Agenda Work from Local to Global and 7. The Power of Measurement: Monitoring Progress.

The outcomes from the CSO consultation were presented to the representatives from governments and UN agencies on the 7 November. The powerpoint presented is annexed to this report. The report is a summary of some of main recommendations by the participating CSO-representatives, on the regional priorities for the post 2015 framework. This report and does not pretend to be exhaustive. Some issue are dealt with in greater detail than others, due to the specific combination of participants in the meeting, for example, education is only partly addressed. The report aims to give a good overview of the diverse views and ideas developed with all participants during the consultation. The report was authored by the members of the organising *steering committee*⁷ representing the Major Groups & Stakeholders, together with the *speakers* who presented the results of the working groups on the 6th and 7th of November.

1) Overarching Principles

The overarching principles of the post- 2015 agenda must be to examine and analyse the root causes of poverty, injustice and structural inequalities, to have a holistic, equitable, especially gender-equitable, and human rights-based agenda and to ensure human rights and well-being for all.

The Post 2015 Framework

Lessons must be learned from the successes and shortcomings of the Millennium Development Goals (MDG). To create a successful post 2015 framework, one single, integrated, universal agenda with universal goals and commitments is needed. The universal agenda must also be tailored to the different national contexts. The new framework must be more comprehensive than its predecessor and the scope of goals

⁶ The United Nations sustainable development and Environment processes recognize nine major groups: 1) Children & Youth, Farmers, Indigenous Peoples, Workers & Trade Unions, Women, Business & Industry, Science & Technology, Local Authorities, NGOs

⁷ For contact information of the steering committee please see the *Major Group* pages at <u>http://sustainabledevelopment.un.org</u>

and targets must not be as constraining as the 8 MDGs. Further, linkages between the different goals must be assured and silos must be avoided.

In order to create a successful post-2015 framework, the process of developing the post 2015 framework must be truly participatory. The participation of CSOs must be ensured at all stages of the post-2015 process, during the negotiations, as well as in the implementation of the agenda.

All three dimensions of sustainable development must be represented in the new framework, which should be human rights-based, take into account planetary boundaries and promote sustainable and inclusive well-being. Equality and non-discrimination, including gender equality, should be the overarching principles of the framework. Further, the global goals should be long-term, with national mid-term goals.

2) Regional Concerns

A number of concerns were discussed, in particular the growing inequalities in Europe and Central Asia. To mention a few; income inequalities, the rural – urban divide and growing unemployment, particularly among women and young people, are all significant challenges. Other hindrances to sustainable developmfent are international financial and trade agreements which limit the scope of countries to raise tax revenue for public funds. One example given are of foreign investments based on tax-exemption, e.g. in the extractive sector (mining), and that do not contribute to development but do create costs to the economy in the form of pollution. Another example of a trend that hinders development in the region is a rolling back of women's rights, such as increasing early enforced marriages, increasing girls dropout levels in schools, increasing rates of violence against women and girls, attack on the sexual and reproductive health and rights of women and girls and other negative trends from patriarchal structures.

3) Measuring Inequalities

New ways to measure inequalities and poverty are needed. Firstly, it must be recognised that the 2 USD per day measure of poverty is inadequate. Secondly, equality must be defined to include justice and non-discrimination. Multiple dimensions of inequality and poverty must be encompassed to include access to power, security, choice, income and capabilities. Poverty should be looked at from a multi-dimensional perspective that would encompass shortage of capabilities, choices, security and power as well as of resources such as income. For this reason we propose to focus on a well-being measure instead of having a goal on income poverty alone. In this way, we hope to tackle the root causes of poverty more comprehensively than a single goal on income poverty could do. Similarly, we propose that the world moves beyond Gross Domestic Product (GDP) as the measurement of growth and progress in a country.

Good Governance

Many aspects need to be included for the new framework to ensure good governance. Firstly, there needs to be a target for transparency, and criteria for state institutions which aim to prevent corruption, enforce legislation, enact sanctions,

uphold legal protection, provide access to justice and an enabling environment for civil society, as well as ensure protection of so-called "whistle-blowers". Secondly, corporate regulations must be strengthened, as well as financial regulations, including those regarding investment programmes within the health and pension sectors. Thirdly, tax justice must be achieved by increasing mining levies. As a good practice Norway's Future Fund (pension fund) was mentioned, which is sourced form an 80 % tax on oil. There must be an end to illicit capital flows and tax evasion, and a target must be developed to close all tax heavens. For example, estimates for developing countries are of 850 billion USD annually⁸ in illicit financial flows, a figure nine times larger than ODA received by these countries.

Finally, we must preserve positive results of sustainable practices and ensure that a human rights-based approach is ensured in the post-2015 agenda, which includes the right to organise.

Accountability

The framework must allow people to hold their leaders to account to the changes they commit to. Rigorous, independent accountability mechanisms will therefore be needed at all levels. Government's accountability for public well-being must be ensured, instead of that of lobby and interest groups. All actors', particularly the private sectors', accountability and transparency must be defined and ensured. There need to be criteria for public-private partnerships ("blending") which ensure public oversight, as well as corporate accountability mechanisms that include mandatory reporting. In terms of global accountability, where existing accountability mechanisms and conventions exists, including, but not limited to: the Universal Periodic Review and the EU Progress Report and Greta. These existing mechanisms should be used and further strengthened. Where currently mechanisms are lacking, new mechanisms must be put in place, including in the area of corporate transparency and accountability. Tools that can be used are performance budgeting, gender budgeting and auditing. One example was given of gender audit of a country's state budget, which showed that 75 % of the budget was benefitting men over women.

Governments must be held accountable to their human rights obligations. These obligations include international human rights instruments and accountability mechanisms, as they relate to the right to health and social rights and address corruption, violence and discrimination, gender-based violence, and the rights of people of diverse sexual orientations and gender identities.

4) The Power of Monitoring

We need more ambitious, global sustainable development goals, with long-term timetables and targets in order to make measurement of progress possible. We must also agree on national and regional target settings and strategies, as well as mid-term targets. An example of this is the national target setting mechanism under the Kyoto Protocol and the Protocol on Water and Health. Further, mechanisms for the full participation of all civil society groups and (other) stakeholders must be ensured, partly by creating joint mechanisms for implementation and involving civil society in

⁸ Est. for year 2010. Global Financial Integrity (2012), Illicit Financial Flows from Developing Countries 2001-2010

information dissemination and implementation of policies and programmes. Examples were given of existing joint implementation councils with 51% civil society, and 49% authorities, as well as multi-stakeholder policy councils chaired by the countries president. Transparency of methodologies and data is also important, as well as mandatory monitoring of each country's progress. Further, data must be disaggregated (for example age, rural-urban, gender, disabilities) to ensure data that measures inequalities and ensures well-being for those most marginalised.

Specific concerns and recommendations for the social and health sectors were put forward. The implementation of existing health policies and programmes needs to be monitored, including those aimed at addressing NCDs, malaria, HIV, TB, child mortality and gender-based violence using human rights instruments. In conclusion, CSOs, NGOs, intermediary organisations, parliamentarians, regional governing bodies, young people, labour unions and other stakeholders must be meaningfully engaged in the planning, implementation and evaluation of policies and programmes.

5) Public Participation

An inclusive and participatory approach (to decision-making) assures the sustainability of policies and their institutionalisation. Participation mechanisms also need to exist at a grassroots level. Two good examples of successful national initiatives to ensure participation were mentioned. First, in Kosovo, councils are made up of 10 government seats, 11 civil society seats. In Armenia, the Prime Minister chairs a multi-stakeholder council.

Participants recommended establishing guidelines for public participation, including allocation of specific seats in such councils to different groups, including young people, women and marginalised groups. It was also recommended that CSO-representatives should make up at least 20 percent of such councils and committees.

Public participation should be included in the decision-making process as well as in agenda-setting, monitoring and evaluation. There needs to be free and previously informed consent, as well as "emergency breaks" for irreversible negative impacts. The Aarhus Convention⁹ must be ratified and implemented, thus ensuring access to public participation, access to justice and access to information. Further, the UN country offices in the region need to fund CSOs at a national level, considering their joint implementation of the post-2015 agenda. Funding must also be ensured for other stakeholders and major groups that participate in the post-2015 process at a global, regional and national level. Civil society should be given the opportunity to put forward shadow reports on the official reports in the process.

6) Equality

A human rights-based approach clearly underlines that all people must benefit from the outcomes of the framework and indeed the most marginalised must be prioritised in order to improve equality. Equality – or eliminating inequality is essential to poverty eradication and sustainable development. The new framework must include a standalone goal to eradicate poverty by eliminating (income) inequality as well as a stand-

⁹ Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-Making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters, Aarhus (1998)

alone goal on gender equality. Other aspects of inequality should be integrated into other goals concerning, e.g. Health, Decent Jobs, Governance, etc. Policy measure must target the most vulnerable, as well as the middle class (which can be targeted by supporting citizen-owned cooperatives, SMEs, etc.). Redistribution measures which target the richest are needed, and barriers, such as education or employment barriers, must be eliminated at an earlier stage, particularly for specific groups such as disabled people.

7) Gender Equality

In the new framework there needs to be a stand-alone goal on gender equality and women's and girls' empowerment. Beyond this, gender equality is a cross-cutting issue and must be integrated into all other goals. As part of this, all forms of violence against women must be eliminated. The Istanbul Convention on VAW¹⁰ must be ratified and implemented, and a target to eliminate honour killings must be included in the framework. There should be no cultural, traditional or religious justifications for violations of women's and girls' human rights. Individuals of diverse sexual orientations and gender identities and expressions should be guaranteed their rights. To accomplish this, important and necessary steps include the use of quotas and affirmative action.

8) Social Protection

Guaranteeing social protection for all, means ensuring minimum levels of income security as well as access to basic services like education, health, water and sanitation, child-care and allowances, social security, care of the elderly, electricity, housing, and food, among other things. Social protection floors are a means to provide social protection to all. Social protection floors can effectively reach the more vulnerable members of society, such as the unemployed, those whose livelihoods depend on precarious and informal work, the sick, the disabled, pregnant women, children and the elderly.

Universal economic and social rights should be recognised, alongside all other human rights, and the freedom of speech, association and assembly must also be respected. Sufficient budgetary allocation for social protection services through the public sector must be ensured, and aid the achievement of all individuals' attainment of the highest standard of health, regardless of status. Also, in times of economic crisis, the economic climate is often used as an excuse to cut public spending and justify social security "reforms". Investments in public institutions aimed at ensuring social rights for all, including those in the informal sector and members of the unemployed population, are needed. Finally, the gender-specific, double-burden and care economy must be addressed and defenders of women's human rights must be protected.

9) Healthy Lives

Universal and human rights-based health coverage is needed, and health policies must address underlying and structural inequalities. These are powerful tools to obtain positive health outcomes. Further, existing health policies must be

¹⁰Access to the full convention <u>here</u>

strengthened, and new ones created, to meet the health needs of marginalised groups. Examples of such marginalised groups include Roma people, sex workers, drug-users, homeless people, LGBTQI people, rural women, young people, people with disabilities and others. Universal access to prevention, diagnostics, and treatment must be provided, as well as care strategies for NCSs, HIV and mental illness. In addition, sufficient budgetary allocation must be ensured in order to provide all individuals with the highest attainable standard of health, regardless of their status and even in times of economic crisis. Finally, all health care providers, including skilled birth attendants, must be trained to provide non-discriminatory and gender-sensitive health services of the highest quality.

10)Sexual and Reproductive Health and Rights

A comprehensive and integrated package of sexual and reproductive health information and services must be provided for all, that is accessible, affordable, available and of the highest quality. These services should include maternal health care, pre- and post-natal care, access to modern methods of contraception, safe abortion services, gynaecological care, breast cancer screenings, infertility treatment, among others. All health policies should incorporate the principles of accessibility, affordability, availability and the highest quality. From a judicial perspective, discriminatory laws must be revised or repealed, along with policies and practices which violate human rights, including the right to privacy and spousal and parental consent laws.

Adolescents and young people must be recognised as having their own rights. Their sexuality must be recognised and respected, and their access to youth-friendly health services must be ensured. Comprehensive sexuality education that is age-appropriate must be provided, and it must address, among other things, human rights, gender equality, and information about sexual and reproductive health and rights. Women and youth-friendly sexual and reproductive health services must also be provided, and be in line with the needs of women and young people's evolving capabilities. In addition, abortion should be decriminalised for women of all ages, regardless of circumstances and diverse forms of families and their access to sexual reproductive health and rights must be recognised.

11)Environmental Health – Eliminating Environmental Determinants of Disease and Mortality

The new framework should include targets to eliminate environmental determinants of non-communicable diseases. There include mandatory substitution of carcinogenic substances and all other chemicals of great grave concern, so called "substances of very great concern". Chemicals which are endocrine-disruptive must be eliminated, including in pesticides. Further, significantly stronger norms are needed to protect the public from radioactivity, specifically the most vulnerable members of the population. Finally, health prevention programmes must set targets to protect the developing child, including stricter norms and standards adapted to the specific health vulnerability of children.

12)Population Dynamics

Development policies which address population dynamics through a human rights based approach must be promoted and include migration flows, an aging population, a decline in fertility and population growth, in accordance with national and sub-regional specificities. Population and development policies and programmes which are human rights-based and include SRHR must be developed. Also, we must ensure that under no circumstances do coercion or violence by the state, in order to expand or contain population growth, prohibit people's rights to move freely across borders. We must also invest in young people's education, employment opportunities and health. People's needs across all ages must be addressed, including elderly people's need for social protection, meaningful engagement in society and access to health services.

13)Migrant's Rights

We must recognise that the free movement of people is a basic human right, enshrined in the Universal Declaration on Human Rights. Documented and undocumented migrants are human beings first and foremost and as such governments have an obligation to ensure that their rights are respected¹¹. The vulnerabilities which migration generates must be addressed, both in countries of departure and arrival. These include brain drain and cheap, undocumented labour, particularly for domestic work. Migration must also be de-stigmatised, and documented and undocumented migrations must be ensured protection from hate crimes, social exclusion and discrimination. Therefore, the UN Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Their Families must be ratified and implemented.

The Rights of Refugees, Internally Displaces Persons and Asylum Seekers

We must address the impact of humanitarian crises and the needs of asylum seekers, refugees and IDPs, and ensure their human rights. Safe and dignified living conditions must be provided, by making necessary allocations for this purpose. Furthermore, all measures must be taken in order to combat forced migration, slavery and trafficking, and vulnerable migrants, especially young women and girls, must be provided with information and services.

14)Employment and Decent Work

Full and productive employment and decent work for all must be part of a post-2015 sustainable development framework. Decent work must be recognized in all its dimensions, job creation, workers' rights, social protection and social dialogue We add that employment generation must include just remuneration; workers' rights must be protected and individuals should have the right to choose their employment; universal social protection which includes income security as well as access to basic services including water and sanitation, education and health among others; and social dialogue through full recognition of the social partners (workers and employers organizations) and the right to bargain collectively are elements that must be explicitly enshrined in the future framework. We also insist that target for the ratification and implementation of ILO conventions be included. The multiple inequalities people face should be effectively addressed by utilizing proven policies

¹¹ The Universal Declaration on Human Rights, Article 13.

and methods for redistribution such as progressive taxation and collective bargaining. Further, internal migration must be understood in the context of employment, and as a result commitments to job creation in rural areas as well as on-the-job training and life-long learning are also important. Finally, women's full and equal participation to in the labour market should be ensured and the burden of care falling upon women should be recognized and redistributed.

15)Education

Universal and equal access to quality education for all girls and boys, including members of marginalised groups must be ensured. Mandatory and free primary and secondary education must be ensured, and the necessary resources and infrastructure for quality education must be provided. Educators must themselves be educated and invested in, whether they be teachers or members of the community.

16)Comprehensive sexuality education

Comprehensive sexuality education must be provided and integrated into school curricula. The sexuality education must be age-appropriate, address human rights, gender equality, relationships, and sexual and reproductive health and rights through the provision of scientifically-accurate, non-judgmental information and the development of decision-making, critical thinking and communication and negotiation skills. School curricula also needs to be reformulated based on a universal human rights perspective, which includes mention of gender norms and workers' rights. In addition, monitoring and evaluation mechanisms need to be established in order to assess the quality of and access to all levels of education. Further, education for sustainable development must be included in education. Finally, the connection between education and the labour market must be strengthened through vocational training, apprenticeships and the development of skills.

17)Environmental Sustainability within Planetary Boundaries and Environmental Governance

The participants in the working group on Environmental Sustainability and Natural Resources developed a number of concrete proposals for goals and targets. They recommend that there must be stand-alone goal(s) addressing environmental sustainability as well as mainstreaming environment in all goal areas.

As a **Goal for Environmental Sustainability** was proposed that by 2020 the nations of the world could commit to limiting the human impact on nature to respect the planetary boundaries, as quantified by Stockholm Resilience Center¹². This should include reducing overshoots in biodiversity, climate and keeping the biogeochemical flows to sustainable levels. **Specific targets** could address increasing the percentage of Green Public Procurement processes to 50 % of all purchases by 2020, 75 % by 2025 and 100 % by 2030. In addition, the loss of biodiversity must be addressed by implementing the Aichi biodiversity targets¹³ through balanced sustainable development to prevent loss of biodiversity and natural ecosystems.

¹² See publication by Stockholm Resilience Center

¹³ See the Aichi Biodiversity targets of the UN Convention on Biological Diversity

In addition to stand-alone goal(s), environmental sustainability must be integrated into all goals. Investing in sustainability will reduce inequalities, e.g. increased local green job creation (also for women and young people), better (occupational) health, less concentration of capital and power, etc. The ecosystem approach should be adopted, as well as payments for ecosystem services in agriculture, for water use and in infrastructure development, etc. Conflicts between economic short-term interests and environmental sustainability, such as large hydro dams and fracking, must be addressed, and mechanisms are needed to evaluate the "value of resources versus price". Further, we must promote and use the traditional knowledge and customary laws of indigenous peoples in the formulation of national policies pertinent to the use of natural resources.

The regeneration of ecosystems and their resilience must be ensured through national policies and programmes, as well as the allocation of green funds. **A proposed target under an economic goal** could be that: Green investment funds should make up more than 50 % of investments by 2025.

Justice concerning resources must be established, by ensuring equal rights to the equitable sharing of natural resources, which includes women's rights to inherit and own land. Further, indigenous peoples must be included in the monitoring of the SDG process, including the respect for and mandatory implementation of free prior and informed consent as prescribed in the UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (UNDRIP). In addition, we must adopt and implement a universal declaration on animal welfare.

18)Climate Change

Climate justice is required, along with recognition of climate change as an obligation. Kenya exemplified this by amending their constitution with provisions specifically related to climate change. A **cap on greenhouse emissions** must be enacted, so that the atmospheric concentrations of CO2 can be decreased and stabilised at 350 ppm, through global and national policies. **Further targets** are needed to reduce the loss of energy during production and transfer, through the use of national policies. Finally, support and financial assistance must be offered to indigenous peoples who are at the forefront of the climate crisis, e.g. in SIDS (Small Island Development States) and the Arctic.

Proposed Climate Protection Targets

• Phase out ineffective subsidies and investments in the development of fossil fuels and increase the production of energy from renewable resources by 20% by 2020, 40% by 2025, and 50% by 2030.By 2030, cities with a population of at least 100.000 inhabitants need to reach carbon neutrality.

• By 2030, ensure sustainable urban planning with appropriate public spaces with at least X square meters per capita in cities of at least 100.000 inhabitants

19)Chemical Safety

In the new framework, there needs to be a **target on the elimination of hazardous chemicals** which protects all people, including the vulnerable population such as

women and children. The UN chemical conventions (Rotterdam, Basel, Stockholm and Minamata¹⁴) and SAICM must be universally ratified and fully implemented.

20)Food, Water

There must also be a **target on waste water management**. We must increase the number of communities with access to functioning wastewater treatment facilities by 50% in 10 years, 80% in 15 years, and 100 % in 20 years. Integrated water resource management systems must be included in national policies and implemented on a national and international level by 2025; these should include water quality and quantity control and management, as well as pollution prevention.

There needs to be a **target concerning food sovereignty**, which includes access to agro-biodiverse genetic resources (such as seeds and animal breeds) and stops GMOs. Small-scale farmers, people working in the fishery industry, especially women, must be recognised as key economic actors.

Finally, **food waste** must be minimised, including the use of grains and oil crops used for animal feed in industrial livestock production. Food consumption patterns must be transformed towards healthy and sustainable diets and the indigenous peoples must be recognised and ensured of their access to their traditional subsistence resources.

¹⁴ See <u>www.unep.org</u> for the websites of the chemicals conventions Rotterdam Convention, Basel Convention, Stockholm Convention and Minamata Convention

ANNEX 1

Participants List CSO Consultation Istanbul 6 November 2013

Name	Country	Organization
Aida Kace	Albania	Albanian Center for Population and Development
Danjela Celaj	Albania	BKTF Coalition
Margarita	Armenia	Association for Sustainable Human
Korkhmazyan		Development
Ashoi Khurshudyau	Armenia	ICHD
Vazgen Khublaryan	Armenia	
Ruslana Aliyeva	Azerbaijan	International Eurasia Press Fund
Umud Mirzayev	Azerbaijan	International Eurasia Press Fund
Aytakin Asgarova	Azerbaijan	"Climate Change & Development" NGO Alliance
Ruhangiz Huseynova	Azerbaijan	Solidarity Among Women Public Union
Vugar Bayramov	Azerbaijan	CESD- Center for Economic and Social Development
Ismayıl Abdullayan	Azerbaijan	
Ilhan Naghiyev	Azerbaijan	
Mutallim Abdulhasanov	Azerbaijan	
Muzad Mammadov	Azerbaijan	Independent Life
Alene Tsitova	Belarus	WHO
Charlotte Pram Nielsen	Belgium	IPPF European Network
Leida Rijnhout	Belgium	ANPED
Anton Leppik	Belgium	International Trade Union Confederation
Samir Mahmic	Bosnia &	Association of Secondary Scholl
	Herzegovina	Students in BİH - Youth Journalist / Press Association in BİH
Nedro Geshev	Bulgaria	Bulgarian Family Planning Association
Bistra Mihaylova	Bulgarien	WECF
Sarah Kennell	Canada	Action Canada for Population and Development
Ljiljana Lukic	Croatia	International Federation of Medical Students' Associations
Kristine Tolic	Croatia	NGO "UMKI" Regional Info Center
Pett Lebeda	Czech Republic	Glopolis
Anna Inger Roe	Denmark	IFMSA (International Federation of
Rasmussen		Medical Students Assocations)
Jouni Nissinen	Finland	European Environmental Bureau / the Finnish Association for Nature Conservation
Marie-Christine NAILLOD	France	CONFEDERATION GENERALE DU TRAVAIL
Matthew Simonds	France	Trade Union Advisory Committee to the OECD

Name	Country	Organization
Sabine Brels	France	Droits des animaux
Anton Pinschof	France	FNAB Farmers and INOFO
Nikdoz Nergadze	Georgia	Parliament
Sascha Gabizon	Germany -	WECF
	Netherlands	
Lauren Bohatka	Italy	UNESIO
Lyudmila Petzova	Kazakhstan	NGO Angel
Anastassiya	Kazakhstan	NGO Angel
Kucher		
Valdete Idrizi	Kosovo	Civikos Platform
Ruzloli Halili	Kosovo	OPM
Arsen	Kyrgyzstan	Reproductive Health Alliance
		Kyrgyzstan
Dastan	Kyrgyzstan	Bishkek Feminist Collective SQ, Kyrgyz
Kasmamytov		Indigo, Labrys
Gulmira Suranaeva	Kyrgyzstan	Reproductive Health Alliance
		Kyrgyzstan
Aizhamal	Kyrgyzstan	APWLD/PA SHAZET
Bakashova		
Domoshov Ilua	Kyrgyzstan	Ecological Movement "BIOM"
Anna Kirilenko	Kyrgyzstan	Ecological Movement "BIOM"
Nurgul Dzhanaeva	Kyrgyzstan	Forum of women's NGOs of Kyrgyzstan
Sabrina Turabaeva	Kyrgyzstan	
Yustayena Grine	KZ	KMDA
Marija Tosheva	Macedonia	Sex Workers Rights Advocacy Network (SWAN)
Natasha Dokovska	Macedonia	Journalists for Human Rights
Spirovska		
Natalia Kravciuk	Moldova	National Center for children and youth Gutta-Club
Cantaraiu Iuliana	Moldova	National UGO Council
Susarenco Anne	Moldova	Y - PEER
Bigana Gugoric	Monte Negro	Expeditio
Dirk	Nederland	WSPA
Jan-Gustav	Norway	Stakeholder Forum
Strandenaes		
Daniel Wisniewski	Poland	World Youth Alliance
Gohar Khojayan	Republic of Armenia	Armenian Women for Health and Healthy Environment
Irina Costache	Romania	ASTRA NETWORK (Central and Eastern European Women's Network for Sexual and Reproductive Health and Rights)
Olga Ponizova	Russia	Eco-Accord
Dragana STOJANOVIC	Serbia	Serbian Association for Sexual and Reproductive Health and Right – SRH Serbia

Name	Country	Organization
Ivana Savic	Serbia	Centre for Human Rights and Development Studies (CHRDS)
Maja Stojanovic	Serbia	Civic Initiatives
Paloma Cantero Gomez	Spain	World Youth Alliance
Hanna Hansson	Sweden	CONCORD Sweden - Beyond 2015
Surayyo Saidova	Tajikistan	ASDP Nau
Shameidoli Renimuv	Tajikistan	Tajikistan National NGO
Sabokhat Rakhimzoda	Tajikistan	Tajikistan National NGO
Michiel Andeweg	The Netherlands	Rutgers WPF
Timo Winfried Bravo Rebolledo	The Netherlands	RutgersWPF
Pinar İlkkaracan	Turkey	WWHR - New Ways
Sehnaz Kiymaz Bahceci	Turkey	WWHR- New Ways Association
Merve Ağın	Turkey	WWHR- New Ways Association
Ayça Üzelgün Tekeli	Turkey	WWHR- New Ways Association
Ebru Batık İşık	Turkey	WWHR- New Ways Association
Teslime Nurlu ERKAN	Turkey	KADER -Adana
Adrien LICHA	Turkey	UCLG-MEWA
Ersin Özütürk	Turkey	Türk Kadınlar Birliği
Mukaades Akbaş	Turkey	KAPADOKYA KADIN DAYANIŞMA DERNEĞİ
Muhtar Çokar	Turkey	Human Resource Development Foundation
Prof.Dr.Şehnaz Karadeniz	Turkey	International Diabetes Federation IDE
lşık Tüzün	Turkey	ERG
Eyüp Özer	Turkey	Disk - Birleşik Metal İş
Ebrize Çeltikçi	Turkey	Çocuk Hakları Zirvesi ve Kalkınma Derneği
Tolga Aksoy	Turkey	Journalists Writers Foundation
Emre Özet	Turkey	IYA Center Association
Marianne	UK	Virginia Gildersleeve International Fund
Haslegrave		
Lesia Pagulich	Ukraine	All-Ukrainian Network of PLWH
Svitlana Slesarenok	Ukraine	NGO Black Sea Women's Club
Guy Cave	United Kingdom	Save the Children
Sarah Gold	USA	IWHC
Jan Van Ravens	USA	UNPP / Yale
Galina Angaivoa	Russia	Tebtebba - Indigenous Peoples Major Group
Salame Mikadeo		Accessible Environment for Everyone

Name	Country	Organization
Nekane Viota Fernández	Spain	UNESCO Etxea
OBSERVERS UN		
orgs		
Evis Kasapi		WHO
Nedret Emiroğlu		WHO
Lutterbad Wolfgang		ILO
Marta Diavolova		UNFPA
Claude Akpokavie		
Eduard Jongstra		UNFPA
Kadir Ahmet Parla		UN
Burcu Morel	Turkey	UNDP / UNV
Ozan Çakmak	Turkey	ILO
Sonya Ruiz	Switzerland	UNICEF
Brunsuhwig		
Linn Cathrin Juell	Norway	UNICEF
Nurjamal	Kyrgyzstan	UNICEF
Tashbolotova		
Enkhtsetsey	Khzakhstan	UN Women Khazakhstan
Miyegombo		
Gabor Nagy	Hungary	UN FAO
Antonius Broen	Azerbaijan	UNDP / UNV
Dag Sigurdson	Azerbaijan	UN HCRG
Nora Sahatciu	Kosovo	UNDCO
Asel	Kyrgyzstan	UN Kyrgyzstan
Abdurahmanova	,	
Andrew Russell	Kosovo	UN Development Coordinator
Monika Linn		UNECE
Michael Kunz		UNECE
Wondwosen		UNEP
Asnake		
Gina Lucarelli		UNDP